

# **EXHIBIT “C”**

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 1

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA  
STATED MEETING

Room 400, City Hall  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania  
Thursday, March 30, 2017  
11:00 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCIL PRESIDENT DARRELL L. CLARKE  
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS  
COUNCILWOMAN JANNIE L. BLACKWELL  
COUNCILMAN ALLAN DOMB  
COUNCILMAN DEREK S. GREEN  
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE  
COUNCILWOMAN HELEN GYM  
COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON  
COUNCILMAN KENYATTA JOHNSON  
COUNCILMAN CURTIS JONES, JR.  
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH  
COUNCILMAN BRIAN J. O'NEILL  
COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE L. PARKER  
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA D. QUINONES-SANCHEZ  
COUNCILWOMAN BLONDELL REYNOLDS BROWN  
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA  
COUNCILMAN AL TAUBENBERGER

MICHAEL A. DECKER, CHIEF CLERK

- - -

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 49

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2           better sustainable future.

3                   Put a moratorium on this  
4           project if you must while we craft this  
5           future, but in fairness, you must  
6           grandfather, without condition, current  
7           permit holders.

8                   Thank you.

9                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

10           Thank you for your testimony, sir.

11                   CHIEF CLERK: Deen Kogan.

12                   Deen Kogan.

13                   (Witness approached podium.)

14                   MS. KOGAN: Hi.

15                   CHIEF CLERK: Commenting on  
16           170093.

17                   MS. KOGAN: It's a lady, not a  
18           man.

19                   I have lived on the 200 block  
20           of Delancey Street for 50 years. We've  
21           had a wonderful neighborhood. Parking  
22           has always been a problem. I have  
23           pictures of 4 o'clock yesterday on my  
24           block, big empty spaces. I thought the  
25           ordinance called for two spots, either

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 50

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2       handicapped or electric or whatever. We  
3       have three. And in my neighborhood, my  
4       immediate neighborhood, Second Street,  
5       Delancey, Pine, we have over nine spaces.  
6       It's caused a tremendous amount of  
7       contention in the neighborhood.

8           I don't understand, and nobody  
9       has been able to explain to me, how  
10       public land has been given to private  
11       owners. One of our electric car owners  
12       had a neighbor towed because they  
13       happened to park in his spot. I've been  
14       threatened, because I have a big mouth.

15           I really appreciate the fact  
16       that City Council is looking into this,  
17       Councilman Squilla, Councilman Oh, and  
18       everybody else. I hope this is just the  
19       beginning, and I really hope that this  
20       ordinance will be overturned completely.  
21       There's no justification for it.

22           My attorney says that we are in  
23       violation of the ADA Act. I have a  
24       couple on my block that I'm speaking for  
25       who need a handicapped space and they

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 51

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2        need it terribly. They can't get it. I  
3        don't know what else to say. I don't  
4        know what else to do, but I sincerely  
5        hope that these people are not  
6        grandfathered in for their lifetime.  
7        It's not fair and it's not what  
8        Philadelphia should be about.

9               If you have any questions, see  
10      me later.

11               COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

12        Thank you for your testimony, ma'am.

13               CHIEF CLERK: Roseanne Loesch,  
14        commenting on 170093.

15               (Witness approached podium.)

16               MS. LOESCH: It's hard to  
17        follow that act.

18               I am actually -- you are in my  
19        district.

20               My name is Roseanne Loesch and  
21        I am President of Society Hill Civic  
22        Association, which represents over 5,000  
23        residents. Thank you, Council President  
24        Clarke and Council and especially  
25        Councilman Oh, for this opportunity to

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 52

1                   3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2                   testify on behalf of the electric vehicle  
3                   charging station moratorium bill, and I'd  
4                   like to thank our District Councilman,  
5                   Mark Squilla, who has strongly supported  
6                   us in trying to correct the current  
7                   situation.

15 Our neighborhood in particular  
16 has had a disproportionate amount of the  
17 total permits issued for this purpose.

18 In Councilman Squilla's district, there  
19 has been about 75 percent of the permits  
20 issued, and our residents have let us  
21 know loud and clear that the  
22 appropriation of a public good for  
23 private use cannot and should not  
24 continue.

25 As you all must be aware, under

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 53

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2           the current practice, in theory, any  
3           electric vehicle can park and use a  
4           recharger installed in front of a private  
5           home. However, in practice, no other  
6           electric vehicle owner but the homeowner  
7           who installed the recharger has access to  
8           it. So essentially this amounts to one  
9           individual getting a permanent personal  
10          parking space on a public street.

11           In our review of other cities  
12          in the United States, no other city  
13          essentially gives away the extremely  
14          valuable commodity of a reserved parking  
15          space to an individual homeowner.

16           The fee the City charges for  
17          this privilege is a tiny fraction of the  
18          price of renting a monthly parking space  
19          in Center City Philadelphia. And  
20          allowing these vehicles to park at night  
21          only is the worst time of day for trying  
22          to find a parking space in our  
23          neighborhood. So that does not solve the  
24          problem.

25           I urge Council to pass this

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 54

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2           bill, and I welcome any questions you may  
3           have from Council.

4           Thank you.

5           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

6           Thank you so much for your testimony.

7           CHIEF CLERK: Mary Pisculli,  
8           commenting on 170093.

9           (Witness approached podium.)

10           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good  
11           morning.

12           MS. PISCULLI: Good morning,  
13           Councilmembers. My name is Mary  
14           Pisculli. I come to ask you to please  
15           preserve the electric vehicle parking  
16           space program as it was written for all  
17           current and approved EV space holders.

18           I'm a proud supporter of the  
19           City of Philadelphia's green initiatives,  
20           and I share the concern of many about our  
21           air quality, our proximity to I-95, and I  
22           sincerely appreciate the Council's  
23           efforts to green the entire city.

24           We purchased an electric  
25           vehicle in October of 2016 after years of

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 56

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2           what these costs were. My electric  
3           vehicle cost \$22,000 more than the  
4           non-electric equivalent. I followed the  
5           spirit and the letter of the law in  
6           selecting my vehicle. Like many others  
7           on the market, it is not compatible with  
8           a DC fast charger. My vehicle's usage  
9           and my reason for buying it are not  
10           compatible with only nighttime charging  
11           or restricted daytime charging.

12           With restricted charger access,  
13           I would not and could not have purchased  
14           my vehicle, which I did only a few months  
15           ago. There are other EV owners that have  
16           the same concerns of short battery time  
17           and need to frequently charge. There is  
18           no industry standard for battery size,  
19           battery range or even charger  
20           compatibility, which I know frustrates  
21           your ability to create a public  
22           infrastructure. This means policy cannot  
23           be retroactively changed as it can't  
24           accommodate the spectrum of EVs that  
25           already have been purchased in keeping

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 57

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2           with the law. Going forward, you may be  
3           able to influence that.

4                   Any change to the ordinance  
5           after we have adopted it is wholly unfair  
6           and will penalize us and other EV owners  
7           who adopted the City's green initiatives  
8           at considerable personal expense and  
9           sends a terrible message about the City's  
10           commitment to green initiatives in the  
11           future.

12                   To comment on what was said  
13           before, I live on the 100 block of  
14           Delancey. I am the only electric vehicle  
15           on that block, where four were eligible.  
16                   There are a couple of open spots on our  
17           street every day for parking. Day  
18           parking is not the issue. I also know  
19           that this is not private land. It does  
20           not increase my property value. It is  
21           not transferable.

22                   Having said that, someone  
23           parked in our charger spot yesterday and  
24           was still there as of 9:30 this morning,  
25           without a ticket.

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 58

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2                           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Can  
3                           you wrap it up, ma'am.

4                           MS. PISCULLI: Thank you. I  
5                           just ask you to please embrace the  
6                           initiative that we embraced in good  
7                           faith.

8                           Thank you.

9                           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:  
10                          Thank you, ma'am, for your testimony.

11                          CHIEF CLERK: Brian Egan,  
12                          commenting on 170093.

13                          (Witness approached podium.)

14                          COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good  
15                          morning.

16                          MR. EGAN: Good morning,  
17                          Council. My name is Brian Egan. I am  
18                          here today requesting that you reject  
19                          proposed Bill 170093. In short, the  
20                          proposed bill disparately treats those  
21                          who have expended significant time and  
22                          resources to participate in  
23                          Philadelphia's novel charging station  
24                          program as compared to other similar  
25                          programs offered by the City.

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 59

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2           In addition, the proposed hours  
3           restriction on electric vehicle parking  
4           does little to curb parking problems,  
5           which are generally present at night, not  
6           during the day, and punish those who rely  
7           on their ability to charge their vehicle  
8           throughout the day.

9           A comparison that has been  
10          missed in this process is, one, The  
11          Philadelphia Code, Section 12-918,  
12          entitled "Parking for Auto Sharing  
13          Organizations." That section of the code  
14          permits for-profit companies, including  
15          Enterprise and Zipcar, to pay \$150 a year  
16          for a street-side parking spot that is  
17          reserved for the exclusive use of a  
18          single ride-share vehicle. These  
19          ride-sharing programs are designed such  
20          that the reserved spot is for the  
21          exclusive use of only a single vehicle.  
22          That is, a member of the ride-sharing  
23          program that chooses to use the vehicle  
24          must return that vehicle to the same  
25          exact spot. This means that any time the

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 60

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2        vehicle is in use, the parking spot  
3        remains vacant and no other vehicle can  
4        park in that spot, not even other  
5        ride-sharing vehicles.

6               These cars can be rented hourly  
7        or by the day, meaning that extensive  
8        periods of time may lapse with the spot  
9        remaining vacant. Yet the City takes no  
10      issue with these vacancies and affords  
11      for-profit companies exclusive rights to  
12      these parking spaces even when some or  
13      all residents in the block are not  
14      members of these ride-sharing programs.

15               By comparison, the electric  
16      vehicle charging station program requires  
17      the same annual expenditure from  
18      participants, \$150 for space in Center  
19      City, but also requires a significant  
20      cost up front, which runs upwards of  
21      \$4,000 for installing the charging  
22      station, plus the cost of the vehicle  
23      itself. The participants and pending  
24      participants are all residents and who  
25      personally absorb the installation cost

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 61

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2           total less than 70 citywide. Zipcar  
3           alone had over 400 vehicles parked  
4           throughout Philadelphia as of June 2015.

5                   In contrast to these reserved  
6           spaces, the electric vehicle parking  
7           spots are not for the exclusive use of a  
8           single electric vehicle. Any electric  
9           vehicle can park in these spots, but  
10           somehow it is the electric vehicle  
11           program that is being singled out by the  
12           City for its exclusivity to the detriment  
13           of those who invested in it. Other  
14           programs, including the for-profit  
15           ride-share program that dedicates a  
16           reserved parking space to a single  
17           vehicle, remain intact.

18                   I urge the Council to take this  
19           point into consideration when evaluating  
20           the merits of Bill No. 170093. The bill  
21           should be rejected and those current  
22           permit holders of electric vehicle  
23           parking spaces should be grandfathered  
24           under the program as originally  
25           implemented.

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 62

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2           Thank you.

3           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

4           Thank you for your testimony, sir.

5           CHIEF CLERK: Jack Cassidy,  
6 commenting on 170093.

7           (Witness approached podium.)

8           MR. CASSIDY: Good morning,  
9 Council.

10           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good  
11 morning.

12           MR. CASSIDY: I'm an electric  
13 vehicle owner with an electric vehicle  
14 parking spot.

15           Sorry.

16           As I stated, I'm an electric  
17 vehicle owner with an electric vehicle  
18 parking spot. I also live in Council  
19 President Clarke's district.

20           I want to give you -- and I  
21 urge Council to vote no on this bill  
22 that's going to restrict our use of  
23 parking from 6:00 p.m. 6:00 a.m.

24           I just want to give you an  
25 example of for me how it will adversely

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 63

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2           affect my use of my car. I purchased  
3           this car about a year ago, and I'm sure  
4           all the other electric car owners will  
5           have similar examples, but I'm going to  
6           give you my example.

7           As I stated, I have a fully  
8           electric car, not a hybrid. And if I  
9           visit my daughter in Langhorne, PA, then  
10           return home, I would be completely out of  
11           electric when I come home. And if  
12           somebody is parking in the spot for the  
13           entire day, I would not be able to use  
14           that charger until 6:00 p.m., and this is  
15           going to restrict my ability to get  
16           around if I want to go out that evening.  
17           So that's a real problem for me, and it  
18           could be problems for everybody else.

19           As you know, electric vehicle  
20           owners made a large investment in this  
21           program, and I just want to give you an  
22           example. As was stated before, electric  
23           vehicles do cost 3,000 to 5,000 more than  
24           combustion engine cars. The electric  
25           installation and the charger was over

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 64

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2           \$3,500. The application just to get into  
3           the program was \$50. There is also a fee  
4           of \$150 that I had to pay for installing  
5           the "electric vehicle only" signs. And  
6           then every year there's a \$75 renewal  
7           fee, which I just paid on March 1st.

8           Now, if this amended bill is  
9           passed, I will have to purchase a permit,  
10           because my street has permit parking. So  
11           that's going to be another whatever it  
12           is, \$20 or \$30.

13           As you know, electric car  
14           owners purchase cars because they like  
15           clean air and they care about the  
16           environment. We followed the rules of  
17           the program as currently posted and  
18           should be grandfathered under the current  
19           rules. Any amendment to the rules should  
20           apply to all new applicants.

21           Thank you.

22           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

23           Thank you for your testimony.

24           CHIEF CLERK: Robert Curley,  
25           commenting on 170093.

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 65

1 3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2 (Witness approached podium.)

3 MR. CURLEY: Good morning and,  
4 again, thank you, Council, for allowing  
5 this testimony. I'm here today on behalf  
6 of the Crosstown Coalition, which is a  
7 coalition of 23 neighborhood civic  
8 associations.

9 The Coalition membership voted  
10 to support Philadelphia City Council Bill  
11 17009301 amending Section 12-1131 of The  
12 Philadelphia Code. The 23 members were  
13 asked on March 23rd to vote yes or no in  
14 support of the bill. In that short  
15 turnaround period, 20 associations  
16 voted - 14 favored the bill and two voted  
17 against it, and four abstained because  
18 they could not convene a board vote in  
19 the time period allowed.

20 The members who voted in favor  
21 agreed to the following statement: The  
22 advent of practical electrical vehicles  
23 is full of promise for cleaner air and  
24 reduced dependence on non-renewable fuel  
25 sources. Their increased use should be

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 66

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT

2           strongly encouraged.

3           However, the use comes with one  
4           major drawback. In a dense urban core  
5           lacking driveways or garages, where do  
6           you plug them in? Providing  
7           infrastructure to recharge electric  
8           vehicles encourages their use.

9           The current practice in  
10          Philadelphia is to reserve on-street  
11          parking spaces for the exclusive use of  
12          one electric vehicle. The Streets  
13          Department may designate a space for an  
14          electric vehicle without consent of the  
15          adjacent neighbors and prohibit  
16          non-electric vehicles from parking in  
17          that space. There are currently no time  
18          limits on the electric parking spaces.

19           This practice has its  
20          consequences. Reserving an on-street  
21          parking space effectively turns a public  
22          asset into a private one, reducing the  
23          availability of on-street parking for  
24          non-electric vehicles in the  
25          neighborhoods where demand for on-street

Stated Meeting  
March 30, 2017

Page 67

1           3/30/17 - STATED - PUBLIC COMMENT  
2           parking exceeds supply. The adverse  
3           effects are exacerbated if there's more  
4           than one electric vehicle designation on  
5           a block or when combined with handicapped  
6           parking and other restrictions.

7           Current practices may also have  
8           a natural limit on how many spaces can be  
9           designated and even breed resentment  
10           among neighbors who own non-electric  
11           cars. Over time both only serve to  
12           discourage electric vehicle usage.

13           The Crosstown Coalition  
14           supports the proposed moratorium on new  
15           electrical vehicle parking spaces  
16           provided that City Council and the  
17           Streets Department investigate best  
18           practices for electric vehicle  
19           infrastructure and recommend workable  
20           alternatives to 24/7 on-street parking  
21           designation that balances the needs of  
22           all City residents. The Coalition  
23           welcomes the opportunity to discuss this  
24           matter further with any Councilmembers.

25           Thank you.